CASE STUDY REPORT

One-to-One Tuition - Communication and Quality Assurance

Chris Stevens

This study was originally published in 2010 as part of the 'What Works Well' initiative, part of the National Strategies for Education in England.

Abstract

Background: The purpose of the study is to evaluate the impact of One-to-one tuition on pupil learning, teaching, and school organization and leadership, and to identify best practices for successful implementation, including consultation with senior and middle leaders, sharing the vision and implementation strategy with tutors, senior leaders and Governors, and Quality Assurance activities to consolidate and share good practice.

Aims: The main aim is to empower leaders to consolidate and share good practice, reward students for completing One-to-one tuition programmes, and enable class teachers to access regular feedback from students.

Methods: Participants in the One-to-one tuition programme include students, teachers, Local Authority contacts, and leaders. They work together to ensure quality assurance and positive outcomes. Methods used include Quality Assurance activities, Local Authority support, school visits, rewards for students, regular feedback from students, and formal reports.

Findings: The main findings of this case study are that One-to-one tuition has had a positive impact on pupil learning, teaching, and school organisation and leadership. It has resulted in increased student confidence, motivation, and self-assessment, as well as improved communication and collaboration between tutors, teachers, and leaders. Senior and middle leaders have been involved in consultation about the principles by which One-to-one provision should be given, and Quality Assurance activities have been put in place to empower leaders to consolidate and share good practice. Rewards and celebrations for students who complete One-to-one tuition programmes have also been explored.

Implications: The findings suggest that One-to-one tuition programmes should be rewarded and celebrated, feedback should be regularly given to class teachers, and the impact of One-to-one provision should be included in school reports.

This abstract was generated by Camtree using a large language model (LLM) and added to the original report in 2023.

Keywords: Secondary education; Assessment and target setting; Leadership; Self evaluation and review; English - speaking and listening; English - writing; Mathematics

Introduction

What were your reasons for doing this type of development work?

The school has successfully implemented One-to-one provision for 38learners at Key Stage 3 in the first year of the national programme in2009-2010. It has also developed a robust and rigorous approach toevidenced-based Quality Assurance across the school and it was therefore important that the outcomes of One-to-one tuition was captured withinthis culture. A careful series of evaluative activities has beendesigned and implemented through a clearly communicated process of selfevaluation to ensure that the programme maximises the potential forcurrent and future learning outcomes. The school has been funded forplaces only at Key Stage 3, although it is also recognised thatappropriate and purposeful intervention at this stage serves tostrengthen the progress of students through transition into Key Stage 4. The experience of the school over the past five years has shown thatcollaborative approaches to evaluation has helped to sustainimprovements over the long term and, should funding remain available,the school seeks to ensure that effective Quality Assurance processesfor One-to-one tuition delivers similarly sustained returns.

Who might find this case study useful?

- Headteacher
- LA adviser
- National Strategies consultant
- Senior leadership team (SLT)
- Subject leader
- Teacher
- Teaching assistant

Description

What specific curriculum area, subject or aspect did you intend to have impact on?

- Assessment and target setting
- Leadership
- Self evaluation and review
- English - speaking and listening
- English - writing
- Mathematics

How did you intend to impact on pupil learning?

The national One-to-one Tuition programme is one element of acomprehensive intervention strategy applied at Key Stage 3 as part ofthe 'Narrowing the Gap' agenda. The intentions for impact on pupillearning outcomes are:1. Enhanced intervention for identified students at Key Stage 3relating to expected age related learning outcomes driven by progresstracking data and teacher recommendation. These students were eitherbelow age related expectation or 'stuck' students where progressionbecame more limited due to a range of learning blockages or barriers.2. Increasing student motivation and engagement to 'have a go' and feel the benefits of successful achievement to further foster a 'Cando' attitude towards learning in a broader range of subjects as well asEnglish and Maths.3. Improved confidence and self esteem of students to improvelearning experiences at Key Stage 3, providing a firmer foundation forprogress at Key Stage 4.

What were your success criteria?

1. To secure improvements in progression and student achievement in keyassessments for English and Maths at Key Stage 3 using Assessing PupilProgress (APP) criteria.2. Student achievement to be in line with age relatedexpectations, where students have positively overcome real and/orperceived barriers to their learning.3. Further enhancing the strategic cohesion between SeniorLeadership and Middle Leaders for English, Maths and Learning Supportdepartments.4. The successful implementation of a rigorous and evidence basedapproach to self evaluation utilising teacher, student and parent voice in addition to learning outcomes5. More confident and positive student learners who are morewilling to actively engage and participate in the learning process inorder to fulfil his/her potential.

What information or data did you use to measure progress towards your success criteria?

- CVA data
- Logs or interviews
- Observation outcomes
- Periodic teacher assessment
- Pupils' work
- Test results

Describe the CPD approaches you used

Pivotal to the success of the One-to-one programme in school is the wayby which class teacher and tutor liaison time is facilitated as part ofthe school day and the 1265 working hours of school teaching staff.Weekly meeting and development time on Wednesdays is used for a widerange of CPD and meeting activities as identified on the schoolcalendar. Approval from the Senior Leadership Team allows for classteachers to withdraw from parts of these activities at the start oftuition for planning and the completion of Individual Tuition Plans(ITPs) and the end of tuition for final review and progress check/handover. The accommodation of this time ensures that teachers are releasedto include the human face to tutor liaison, adding value to theintervention process and complying with national guidance. It alsoensure that tutors can engage with an activity for which they arealready paid. The school strongly believes that face to face dialogue is more effective and preferable to other forms of professional exchange,further ensuring that planning is student centred. The reality is that,in order not to miss out on any developmental opportunity, that tutorsand teaching staff are very flexible around when they meet during theschool day. Whilst this is positively acknowledged, it remains important that the school is seen to have an official line as to when liaison and planning time takes place.

An additional strategy to support adult CPD also includes two good practice meetings for tutors held at school during the year. This ishighly valued by the tutors as it provides them with an opportunity tomeet each other and share experiences/resources. Each meeting isstrictly one hour and takes place during after school hours. Once again, the 'What is working well' and 'Even better if' framework is applied.

The school has also ensured that all tutors have attended LocalAuthority training and have access to APP assessment criteria as part of tuition planning. The Local Authority has also prepared an evaluationmatrix to enable schools to formally evaluate the provision in terms ofactivity and impact. The Deputy Head has used this document (see below)in order to determine the range of Quality Assurance activitiesundertaken.

What CPD materials, research or expertise have you drawn on?

Local Authority training for One-to-one tutors on the application of APP for individual student planning and session delivery to secure progressInternal experience on QA processes including lesson observationtraining, work sample analysis, student/parent voice feedback andevaluative report writing. Internal school policy and supporting documents for securing high quality Teaching & Learning experiences for all learners

Who provided you with support?

- Local authority staff
- Senior management

How were you supported?

Significant support for the implementation of One-to-one tuition came from the Local Authority in terms of:

- Guidance on implementation for senior leaders
- Training for One-to-one tutors in both Literacy and Numeracy
- Examples of tutor observation schedules, parent/student voice surveys, programme evaluation matrix
- Email/telephone support
- Access to a regional Virtual Learning Platform (Fronter) to access and share learning/strategic resources

Please see attached documents throughout this case study.

Support was also provided from the Senior Leadership Group interms of consultation and approval for the model of One-to-one delivery. At The Minster School the model which has been applied is based onutilising extended school hours rather than disrupting learningcontinuity during the school day. This is appropriate given therelatively small number of places offered.

Impact

What has been the overall impact on pupil learning?

72% of students who have participated in the One-to-one programme haveachieved between 1 and 3 sub levels of progress over the ten weekcourse, 50% have made between 2 or 3 sub levels of progress. Thisapplies to both Literacy and Numeracy.

Students have spoken directly about the greater sense of selfconfidence they believe they have gained, with a greater degree ofwillingness to engage with classroom activities rather than beingpassive learners.

Teachers have noted through empirical evidence that studentsappear to be more 'switched on' and willing than had previously been the case.

Thoughts you think are relevant to overall impact on learning

Key aspects which have impacted upon pupil learning are:

- The dynamic and interactive approach adopted by tutors whenplanning sessions, so as to encourage student articulation ofunderstanding rather than spending a lot of time on repetitive practicequestions or ultimately doing the work for the students. Each hoursession is very intense, therefore a variation of activity and resourceis essential.
- Effective modelling of learning expectations allowing studentsto always have something to refer to in

order to check understanding.

- The application of the ten principles of Assessment forLearning (Assessment Reform Group 2004) as an integral aspect of tutorplanning, particularly self-assessment and diagnostic review ofstudents' work, enabling students to visually appreciate 'how' toimprove rather than simply 'what' to improve. Consistency in the use ofAPP criteria is also essential.
- The incorporation of student voice into the content of tutorsessions, creating a spirit of co-construction which further developspositive working relationships between tutor and student.

Quotes you think are relevant to overall impact on learning

"Tuition has helped me because I have now caught up with the rest of my class and am finding things much easier"

"I thought it was really good because it has made me want to work harder using easier methods"

"One-to-one tuition has made me feel a lot more confident about maths and that I can do it"

"I think it is amazing how much is done in a short time and by how much you can improve"

Quantitative evidence of impact on pupil learning

- Periodic teacher assessment
- Test results

Qualitative evidence of impact on pupil learning

- Logs or interviews
- Observation outcomes

Describe the evidence of impact on pupil learning

Evidence of impact:

- APP Progress data indicates 72% of participants have achievedbetween 1 and 3 sub levels of progress, with 50% achieving between 2 or 3 sub levels of progress.
- Tuition lesson observations (15 minute maximum duration) showconsistency in the interactive and co-constructive styles of teachingutilised by tutors delivering dynamic sessions.
- Student progress logs and survey returns demonstrate that ahigh proportion of students have gained in self confidence and selfmotivation - at least 75% of students claim that this is a very positive aspect.

What has been the impact on teaching?

The impact on tutor teaching:

- Greater consistency has been brought about through organisingtutor team meetings twice per year (on a paid basis) to share goodpractice and talk through resources, tutor activities that generate high impact. This has helped to ensure that both the documentation anddegree of planning for sessions has become increasingly more consistent.
- The feedback, formal and informal, between tutor and classteacher has assisted in bringing differentiated provision in to regularlessons which are inclusive of all students but also include specificchallenges to tutored individuals to test out the impact on learningfrom the tuition sessions. Whilst the school has more work to undertaketo monitor this, the sign are very positive to date.

Quotes you think are relevant to the impact on teaching

Tutor: " I like the way that the One-to-one tuition has evolved at the school"

Tutor: " With regard to the paperwork, I don't think you could get away with much less!"

Evidence of impact on teaching

- Evidence from observation and monitoring
- Evidence from planning
- Teacher perceptions

Describe the evidence of impact on teaching

Evidence:

- Teacher perceptions from empirical classroom observation andformal/informal feedback between class teacher and tutor. Sometimes,this has occurred on a weekly basis.
- Planning documentation shows clear reference to APP criteriawhich empowers students to plan dynamic tutor sessions accordingly.
- Teacher observation validates student self perceptions in terms of growing self confidence and motivation, which further encouragesclass teachers to sustain the momentum of developing a 'can do' attitude towards learning

What has been the impact on school organisation and leadership?

During the first year of the national programme, two cohorts ofOne-to-one tuition placements have been successfully completed - with a92% success rate in terms of full attendance to all ten tuitionsessions. Effective systems and communication processes have beensuccessfully implemented as suggested through the attached documents tothis case study. A clear emphasis has been placed on quality assuranceand feeding back evaluative outcomes to all stakeholders in order todetermine and communicate impact.

Tutors, students (and parents), Curriculum Team Leaders andGovernors have commented very favourably on the service offered and the impact that this has had.

The school has been identified by the Local Authority as one ofbest practice and invited to present at regional good practice eventsand become a lead One-to-one tuition school - offering further adviceand support to other centres.

Evidence of impact on school organisation and leadership

Evidence of impact:

- Subject leaders and class teachers are now more able toidentify and intervene with students who require additional support -initially through data trends but also through professional judgement(something which has been welcomed in the school).
- Tuition observations show greater consistency in planningdocumentation and lesson delivery through the facilitation of goodpractice meetings.
- The publication of an annual teaching and learning report,inclusive of One-to-one tuition, consolidates and shares all evaluativefindings in order to sustain and further enhance the quality ofprovision.

Summary

What is the crucial thing that made the difference?

- Ensuring that time is made available to facilitate high qualityplanning conversations between class teachers and students, rather thanthese consultations being seen as an additional burden on teachingstaff.
- Ensuring that a member of the Senior Leadership Group isinvolved in the coordination and Quality Assurance of the One-to-oneprogramme.
- Ensuring that sensitive communication is consistently adheredto - particularly in bringing tutors together at key times to here andact on key messages.
- Involving students, and parents, in the co-construction oftuition sessions which are ultimately designed to meet their needs.

What key resources would people who want to learn from your experience need access to?

- Nottinghamshire evaluation matrix for One-to-one provision
- National guidance for the implementation of One-to-one tuition (National Strategies)
- Tuition observation schedule
- Parent guide and invitation letter
- Parent and student voice surveys

What CPD session and resources were particularly useful?

- Local Authority briefings as part of National Strategies implementation
- Local Authority Virtual Learning Environment (Fronter) for sharing resources, strategic documents and ideas
- Formalising class teacher and tutor liaison time to ensure high quality student centred planning and creation of ITPs (IndividualTuition Plans)
- Establishing forum meetings to consolidate and spread good practice between tutors and middle leaders

If another individual or school was attempting to replicate this work, where would they start and what would the essential elements be?

Start by involving senior and middle leaders in consultation about theprinciples by which One-to-one provision should be given. Once aprinciple-based programme is established, it is then important to sharethis vision and accompanying implementation strategy with tutors, senior leaders and Governors. It is vital that time is made available tofacilitate and ensure high quality planning and communication betweenall stakeholders - as time is a precious commodity, this provisionpositively acknowledges the efforts made by individuals and puts a human face on the planning aspects of the initiative. Finally, even beforethe first tuition session commences, have a programme of QualityAssurance activities in place which empowers leaders to consolidate andshare good practice and feedback positive and developmental outcomes tothose concerned. Find out who your Local Authority contact is forsupport and explore the possibilities of visiting a school as anadditional means of getting started.

What further developments are you planning to do (or would you like to see others do)?

- Exploring ways in which students who complete One-to-one tuition programmes are rewarded and their achievements celebrated.
- Enhancing the means of enabling class teachers to access moreregular feedback from students to

maintain a positive learning dialoguewith them

• Building One-to-one provision and impact in to formal teaching, learning and standards reports as part of the whole school policy onself evaluation.

Supplementary Materials

This report is accompanied in the library by the following supplementary material:

• Invitation letter/contract
• Official school guide distributed to all identified parents
• Parent Voice Survey
• Principles for student identification
• Schedule used for undertaking 15 minute tutor observations
• Student passport of learning progress log
• Student Voice Survey
• Evaluation matrix
• Good practice visit note (Nottinghamshire, June 2010)

About Camtree

Camtree: the Cambridge Teacher Research Exchange is a global platform for close-to-practice research in education. Based at Hughes Hall, University of Cambridge, Camtree draws on high-quality research from around the world to support educators to reflect on their practice and carry out inquiries to improve learning in their own classrooms and organisations. You can find out more about Camtree and its digital library at www.camtree.org.

About 'What Works Well'

This case study was originally published as part of the 'What Works Well' section of the National Strategies for Education in England. The National Strategies were professional programmes aiming for improvements in the quality of learning and teaching in schools in England. 'What Works Well' involved teaching practitioners from all phases and areas of education sharing accounts of real developments which had improved learning and teaching, and made a difference to pupil progress. 'What Works Well' case studies were designed to support practice transfer and include sufficient detail and resources to enable others to implement the effective practice described. They were reviewed by experts prior to publication as 'User Generated Content' (UGC) under a licence which encouraged reuse and derivative works, but which precluded commercial use.

Licence

This edited version of this case study is published by Camtree as a derivative work of the original under a Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial Licence (CC-BY-NC 4.0). The structured abstract that accompanies it was generated by Camtree in 2023 using the OpenAI GPT-3.5-Turbo Large Language Model.